



Policy Development in the AFRINIC Region

Seun Ojedeji
PDWG Co-Chairs

AFRINIC-23 – Pointe-Noire, Congo

Dec 2 2015



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Development Agenda

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ **Policy Session 1: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 11:00 – 12:30**
 - ▶ The Policy Development Process
 - ▶ Report of Recently Ratified/Implemented Policies
 - ▶ Summary of proposals under discussion in AFRINIC
 - ▶ Summary of Interesting proposals in other regions
- ▶ **Policy Session 2: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 13:30 – 15:00**
 - ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources
 - ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy
- ▶ **Policy Session 3: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 15:30 – 17:00**
 - ▶ Staff Policy Implementation Experience Report
 - ▶ Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP
 - ▶ Policy Development Open Microphone



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Session 1: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ The Policy Development Process
- ▶ Report of Recently Ratified/Implemented Policies
- ▶ Summary of proposals under discussion in AFRINIC
- ▶ Summary of Interesting proposals in other regions

Introduction to the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

- ▶ Defined by policy AFPUB-2010-GEN-005
 - ▶ <http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/251-policy-development-process-in-the-afrinic-service-region-afpub-2010-gen-005>
- ▶ Summarised on web page: <http://www.afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development>
- ▶ Principles of openness, transparency, fairness

Introduction to the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

You
are
here





28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Policy Development Working Group (PDWG)

- ▶ Resource Policy Discussion mailing list (RPD) is open to anybody

Subscribe <https://lists.afrinic.net/mailman/listinfo.cgi/rpd>

Archives <http://lists.afrinic.net/pipermail/rpd>

- ▶ Public Policy Meetings are open to anybody
- ▶ Anybody who participates is considered a member
- ▶ Two co-chairs selected for staggered two-year terms
 - ▶ Seun Ojedeji, Q2 2015 – Q2 2017
 - ▶ Barry Macharia, Q1 2014 – Q1 2016

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Submitting a proposal

- ▶ Anyone can submit a proposal.
- ▶ submitted to the Resource Policy Discussion mailing list
- ▶ AfriNIC will provide administrative support and assist in drafting, if requested
- ▶ AfriNIC shall also provide relevant facts and statistics if requested



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Draft Policy

- ▶ Posted to RPD mailing list
- ▶ Published on AFRINIC web site
- ▶ Must be available for review at least four weeks before then next public policy meeting
- ▶ Changes may be made based on discussion
- ▶ Expires after one year, unless approved by the Board of Directors, or replaced by a new version.
- ▶ May be withdrawn by the author.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Public Policy Meeting

- ▶ Proposal is placed on agenda
- ▶ Agenda announced on RPD mailing list two weeks before meeting
- ▶ No changes allowed in the last week before the meeting
- ▶ PDWG chairs determine whether consensus is reached at the meeting
 - ▶ If no consensus, then back to the mailing list for further discussion, or author can submit a new version
 - ▶ This is implied, but not explicitly stated, in the PDP
- ▶ Minutes published within three weeks after the meeting



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Last Call

- ▶ (If there was consensus at the Public Policy Meeting)
- ▶ Two-week last call on the mailing list
- ▶ PDWG chairs determine whether there is consensus based on the discussion at the meeting and the discussion during the last call.

Approval

- ▶ If there is consensus, PDWG chairs recommend the proposal to the Board for approval
- ▶ Report of discussions and feedback
- ▶ The draft policy shall be ratified by the AfriNIC Board of Directors



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Implementation

- ▶ Adoption and implementation date is announced on the RPD mailing list
- ▶ Should be less than six months after the end of the last call

Details of the Policy Development Process

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

Conflict Resolution

- ▶ There is a discussion and appeal process for people who disagree with decisions made by the chairs.

Varying the Process

- ▶ It is possible to vary the process in case of emergency.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Implementation Report

Status of Recently Ratified Policy Proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

- 1. AFPUB-2014-GEN-004-DRAFT-03 Resource Reservation for Internet Exchange Points**
 - ▶ **Approved (Consensus)** June 2015
 - ▶ **Ratified by the Board** August 2015
 - ▶ **Implementation Q1 2016** - (Code Changes to WHOIS/MyAFRINIC)
- 2. AFPUB-2014-GEN-003-DRAFT-04 Anycast Assignments in the AFRINIC region**
 - ▶ **Implemented.**



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of proposals under discussion in AFRINIC*

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

*Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number
Resources*

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Number Resources Transfer Policy



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of AF PUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AF PUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AF PUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ <http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1483-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources>
- ▶ The Current AFRINIC policies do not explicitly allow or disallow Out-Of-Region use of Internet number resources.
- ▶ This proposal seeks to define limit of certain percentage on Internet number resources that can be used by a member outside the region.
- ▶ This proposal does that by removing these words from the existing
- ▶ This proposal if ratified will explicitly permit out-of-region use of AFRINIC's number resources



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process

Policy Implementation

Proposal summary (AFRINIC)

Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002

Out of Region Use

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001

Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building

Open Microphone

- ▶ <http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1499-number-resources-transfer-policy>
- ▶ This proposal seeks to allow transfer of AFRINIC allocated resources both in and out of the region.
- ▶ It seeks to solve the issue of an African organisation using space in another Region.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of Interesting proposals in other regions

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

ARIN
LACNIC
APNIC
RIPE



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

ARIN region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Presented by David Huberman



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

LACNIC region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRICNIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

LACNIC Proposal

Purpose

LAC-2015-3: IPv4 exhaustion policy with a scheduled termination date and the scheduled return of large users' blocks.

In order to force the migration from IPv4 to IPv6, it is suggested that large users of IPv4 blocks return a percentage of the blocks they have been issued every year (1/15th) for use by those smaller members that need that space ; this way, large users could catalyze the migration from IPv4 to IPv6.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

APNIC region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Presented by Anton Strydom



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

RIPE region: Policy proposals

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Presented by Ingrid Witje



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Session 2: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 13:30 – 15:00

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources
- ▶ Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Current version AFPUB-2014-GEN-002-DRAFT-04

<http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1483-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources>

Submission Date 13 Oct 2014

Author Douglas Onyango

Revisions

- ▶ AFPUB-2014-GEN-002-DRAFT-01 <http://www.afrinic.net/en/library/policies/archive/1243-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources-afpub-2014-gen-002-draft-01>
- ▶ AFPUB-2014-GEN-002-DRAFT-02 <http://www.afrinic.net/en/library/policies/archive/1403-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources-afpub-2014-gen-002-draft-02>
- ▶ AFPUB-2014-GEN-002-DRAFT-03 <http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1157-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources>



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of AF23-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AF23-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AF23-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ <http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1483-out-of-region-use-of-afrinic-internet-number-resources>
- ▶ The Current AFRINIC policies do not explicitly allow or disallow Out-Of-Region use of Internet number resources.
- ▶ This proposal seeks to define limit of certain percentage on Internet number resources that can be used by a member outside the region.
- ▶ This proposal does that by removing these words from the existing
- ▶ This proposal if ratified will explicitly permit out-of-region use of AFRINIC's number resources



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AF PUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AF PUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

1 Summary of the Problem Being Addressed by this Policy Proposal

Currently AFRINIC's policies do not explicitly allow or disallow Out-Of-Region use of Internet number resources. This silence on an important aspect of number resource management jeopardizes administration by leaving staff to decide arbitrarily how to handle Out-Of-Region requests. The imminent exhaustion of IPv4 aggravates the situation, as it is anticipated that organizations from other regions will have more incentive to exploit this and other loopholes in AFRINIC's policies to acquire resources for sale or use outside the region.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFRINIC-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

2 Summary of How this Proposal Addresses the Problem

- a This policy tries to be a disincentive to organizations from other regions that want to acquire number resources from AFRINIC for use in ways that are not in the best interests of the AFRINIC community. The policy also provides guidance on how resources allocated and assigned by AFRINIC maybe be used out of region by legitimate AFRINIC members.
- b For the avoidance of doubt, the author does not seek to prolong the lifespan of IPv4 with this policy; rather, to ensure that number resources allocated and assigned by AFRINIC are used by members from the service region to support their legitimate network operations, regardless of physical location.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- c For purposes of clarity, this policy in no way promotes Out-Of-Region use of Internet resources. Instead, it is cognizant of the fact that organizations with allocations from AFRINIC may need to use some of their resources outside of the region to support their in-region network operations.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3 Proposal

- a Upon ratification of this policy, out-of-region use of AFRINIC's number resources shall be permitted as long it is preceded by use within the region.
- b Notwithstanding 3a, the number resources used outside the region at any time shall not exceed 40% of the total space in use by a member. Total space in use shall be calculated as follows: if x be the allocation size; and y the amount of space in use at time z , then 40% of y shall be the ceiling).
- c Regional Internet Number resources usage will be determined using Whois database information, global routing table announcements, and for purposes of consistency, other criteria prescribed by AFRINIC.
- d AFRINIC staff shall by use of 3c, carryout due diligence to assess compliance with 3a and 3b.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- e This policy shall forthwith be part of the acceptable use policy for Internet numbers and any breaches shall be dealt with in accordance with the RSA and other AFRINIC policies.
- f For the avoidance of doubt, this policy shall not be applied in mutual exclusion, but, shall complement already existing policies and other eligibility criteria prescribed by AFRINIC.
- g This policy shall apply to past, present and future allocations made by AFRINIC.
- h This policy shall remain in effect until:
 - i It is directly replaced by another policy or it is superseded by a board resolution.
 - ii Section 3.8 of the IPv4 Softanding Policy kicks in. (Use of IPv4 space from the last /8 outside the region shall be only to facilitate connectivity back to the region).



Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Summary of comments from the list

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ **Ref to 3g.** This policy shall apply to past, present and future allocations made by AFRINIC. Can this still be billed as applying the policy retrospectively?
Author response: Proposed edit to This policy shall apply to all allocations and assignments made after ratification of this policy
- ▶ There has been no other comments since new version was posted.
- ▶ We need more comments?



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: AFRINIC Staff Analysis

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

1. Staff Interpretation and Understanding

The policy attempts to define what percentage of the number resources allocated to an AFRINIC member can be used outside of the AFRINIC service region.

2. Comments Staff Comments

- ▶ Sec 3b the reference of time z appears not necessary. Also edit "if x be the allocation size" to "if x be the total space".
- ▶ Sec 3c the proposal needs to be as clear as possible on what methods AFRINIC staff shall use to measure resources used out-of-region from any given allocation, instead of leaving this to the discretion of AFRINIC staff.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: AFRINIC Staff Analysis

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

b Legal Advisers Assessment and Comments

Replace content of Clause 3f with: To all intents and purposes, this proposed policy shall be read and applied in addition to any such existing AFRINIC policy(ies) governing the same subject matter.

3. Resource Impact

N/A

4. Summary and Recommendations

As written, the proposal will present issues to implement, especially Clause 3c, which gives AFRINIC staff discretion on determining how to compute resources used out-of-region. The method of computation needs to be explicitly defined in this policy.



Proposal AFPUB-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Past comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ The policy should not apply to address space acquired before policy is ratified. The author stated he would consider rewording if this is an issue.
- ▶ It was suggested that the proposal not be retroactive, but restrict on future resources only, and that AFRINIC conducts a thorough analysis and reports on how many members would be affected if the policy as written were ratified.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Past comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFRINIC-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ The provisions in RFC2050 and RFC7020 should guide staff. If networks span regions, the requestor should go to other RIR service the region where its other networks are located in the principle of aggregation. Allocations should not be based on percentages but need, and needs should be based on aggregation and minimum size.
- ▶ The author commented on the need to apply the policy to just LIRs, in reaction to AFRINIC comment that there is no way to measure End User/PI space utilization. It was suggested that all membership types should have the same rules otherwise; the policy will encourage abuse of the system.

Proposal AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Past comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFRINIC-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Several speakers supported the intent of the proposal, but suggested that the way its written does not solve the out-of-region resource usage issue due to challenges in enforcement.
- ▶ There were suggestions that a clear definition of out-of-region use be put in place, as this will be the starting point to resolve ambiguities.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002: Out-Of-Region Use of AFRINIC Internet Number Resources

Discussion points

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other
regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFRINIC-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFRINIC-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Does the problem described in section 1 really exist?
- ▶ Does the Resource transfer policy proposal address the problem?
- ▶ Does this proposal have any positive/negative impact on v6 deployment globally?
- ▶ Does the fourth draft address previous comments?
- ▶ Does the community now have more clarity on what "out-of-region" means?



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Current version AFPUB-2015-GEN-001-DRAFT-01

[http://afrinic.net/en/community/
policy-development/policy-proposals/
1499-number-resources-transfer-policy](http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1499-number-resources-transfer-policy)

Submission Date 29 October 2015

Author Mark Elkins



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Summary of AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ <http://afrinic.net/en/community/policy-development/policy-proposals/1499-number-resources-transfer-policy>
- ▶ This proposal seeks to allow transfer of AFRINIC allocated resources both in and out of the region.
- ▶ It seeks to solve the issue of an African organisation using space in another Region.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

1.0 Summary of the Problem Being Addressed by this Policy Proposal

AFRINIC is the only Regional Internet Registry without a Transfer policy for the movement of numbering resources - both in and out of the Region. APNIC, RIPE NCC and ARIN have compatible Transfer Policies, so it would seem wise to be compatible with them.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

2.0 Summary of How this Proposal Addresses the Problem

The Policy solves the issue of an African organisation using space in another Region. This Proposal currently does not attempt to address Legacy Resources (IPv4 and ASN's) - that is resources that are in the AFRINIC Region and were acquired before ARIN existed. Legacy Resources may be moved out of the AFRINIC region and redeployed freely. They may however be subject to the receiving RIR's policies.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3.0 Proposal

3.1 The source entity must be the current rights holder of the IPv4 address resources recognized by the RIR responsible for the resources, and not be involved in any dispute as to the status of those resources.

- A.** Source entities outside of the AFRINIC region must meet any requirements defined by the RIR where the source entity holds the registration.
- B.** Source entities within the AFRINIC region will not be eligible to receive any further IPv4 address allocations or assignments from AFRINIC for a period of 12 months after a transfer approval, or until the exhaustion of AFRINIC's IPv4 space, whichever occurs first.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

This restriction is excluded if the Resource is transferred to the same business entity operating in a different region.

- C** Source entities within the AFRINIC region must not have received a transfer, allocation, or assignment of IPv4 number resources from AFRINIC for the 12 months prior to the approval of transfer request. This restriction excludes Mergers and Acquisitions transfers and Transfers to the same business entity in a different region.
- D** The minimum transfer size is a /24.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3.2 Conditions on recipient of the transfer:

- A. The conditions on a recipient outside of the AFRINIC region will be defined by the policies of the receiving RIR.
- B. Recipients within the AFRINIC region will be subject to current AFRINIC policies and sign an RSA for the resources being received.
- C. Recipients within the AFRINIC region must demonstrate the need for up to a 24-month supply of IPv4 address space.
- D. The minimum transfer size is a /24.

4.0 Version History 30 Oct 2015

AFPUB-2015-GEN-001-DRAFT-01 Posted to the rpd list.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Africa will never need an IPv4 transfer policy - due to the lack of small to mid size commercial ISP, a transfer policy might only centralize IP addresses to very few large telcos/ISPs.
- ▶ The proposal should wait a couple of years till there is more development in the continent before it can be relevant.
- ▶ The 12-month period in Clause 3c should be made longer.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Compatibility of the policy with that of other RIRs may not be in the best interests of the AFRINIC region. It should be tailored to the best interests of the region.
- ▶ The policy should properly address how legacy registrations are handled.
- ▶ Clause 3c, makes it possible for entities in Africa to create temporary entities strictly for the purpose of exporting and monetizing AfriNIC resources 12 months after obtaining their initial resources, which is an avenue for abuse.

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ The proposal would open the door for companies that have no operations in Africa and allow them to take the addresses remaining in AfriNIC's IPv4 inventory for their real operations on different continents, with no benefit to the African Internet community.
- ▶ The proposal seems to address African companies wanting to expand outside Africa. As this would be a tiny percentage of African companies, the proposal is not representative of a large part of African companies needs and therefore not in community's best interests (unless there are figures to prove otherwise).



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ As space depletion accelerates in Africa, we will get to a point where a transfer policy that allows for transfers WITHIN Africa becomes necessary, since there will be genuine need for IP space by African ISPs.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ The policy should be modified to also support transfer of assets WITHIN the African region between African players, and perhaps to prohibit the transfer of space to companies outside of the region.
- ▶ Allow only transfers within Africa, and only start inter-RIR when the Africa pool is empty.
- ▶ Allow only transfers within Africa, and only start inter-RIR when we hit soft-landing. Is the minimum transfer size of /24 a lifetime minimum or an annual minimum?
- ▶ Legacy space should be left out of the policy completely



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Summary of comments

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Policy does not seem beneficial to the region. (It disadvantages us more than it advantages us).



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: AFRINIC Staff Analysis

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

1. Staff Interpretation and Understanding

In its current form, the proposal is not clear for staff to understand, interpret and implement as written.

2. Comments Staff Comments

- ▶ The title of the proposal is vague about whether this is an intra-RIR or inter-RIR transfer policy.
- ▶ Section 2, which is meant to be a summary of how the proposal addresses the problem in Sec 1, introduces a separate topic about transfers of legacy resources. This is a very critical issue that should be introduced separately in Section 3 and be removed from the summary section.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: AFRINIC Staff Analysis

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Definition or classification of the various types of transfers and a detailed process on how AFRINIC will conduct each of those transfers is missing in Sec 3.
 - ▶ Sec 3b mentions exhaustion of IPv4 space this is ambiguous and should be clear on whether this refers to the start of issuance from the last /8, or the invocation of the soft-landing policy.
 - ▶ Sec 3.1b refers to same business entity. This needs to be properly defined in order not to confuse AFRINIC staff with interpretation.
- b Legal Advisers Assessment and Comments**
None.

3. Resource Impact

N/A



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: AFRINIC Staff Analysis

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

4. Summary and Recommendations

This proposal is confusing for staff to properly interpret and implement as written, until the authors can act upon the staff comments above.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Proposal AFPUB-2015-GEN-001: Number Resources Transfer Policy Discussion points

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- ▶ Is there a problem that this policy attempts to solve?
- ▶ Does the "Out of Region policy" address the problem?
- ▶ Does the policy have any impact (negative or positive) on v6 deployments?
- ▶ Is this policy required at this point in time?



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Session 3: Wed, 2 Dec 2015, 15:30 – 17:00

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

- ▶ Staff Policy Implementation Experience Report
- ▶ Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP
- ▶ Policy Development Open Microphone

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Staff Policy Implementation Experience Report

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience

Consensus Building
Open Microphone

► To be provided by Mhadvi



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

1.0 Introduction

The AFRINIC Policy Development Process (PDP) is done in an open, transparent and multi-stakeholder manner where everyone irrespective of status can propose and/or participate in the PDP

The contributions/discussions made from that point when a policy is proposed, are what helps inform the level of consensus of the community towards a particular policy proposal. The Co-Chairs of the Policy Development Working Group (PDWG) are tasked with the role of determining whether there is consensus from the community to perform certain actions on a particular policy.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

Means of Contribution to the Policy Proposals:
Discussions on policy proposals happen on the mailing list (rpd@afinic.net) and at AFRINIC public policy meetings. Unless otherwise agreed through a community decision making process, those two means remain the only source of all information that helps inform/guide the Co-Chairs in their decision making process.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

2.0 Stages of Consensus building

2.1 Discussions on rpd list: In accordance with the PDP, the author proposes a policy, which is then sent to the rpd list for discussion. The Co-Chairs follow discussions on the mailing list, observing points raised by the participants. Although Co-Chairs don't share their opinions on a policy proposal, they may respond on the list whenever there are points made, which the Co-Chairs find not to be clear enough to determine what the writer was trying to communicate and/or those questions or comments directly addressed to the co-chair. The discussion continues until the next public policy meeting. Meanwhile, the Co-Chairs take note of all the points raised on the mailing list.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

2.2 Discussions at a public policy meeting: At the public policy meeting, participants join the discussion either face-to-face and/or remotely. The author(s) present the latest version of the policy to the community and the Co-Chairs also present the summary of points that have been raised on the list, plus any staff assessments. Co-Chairs make the first attempt to indicate what they observe to be the direction of most contributors towards the proposal.

The Co-Chairs then open the floor for further discussions. During these discussions, the Co-Chairs drive the discussions in a manner that ensures everyone (including the author(s)) have the opportunity to raise their views towards gaining more clarity on the proposal, while identifying possible areas of possible improvement.

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3.0 Gauging Consensus

3.1 3.1 After adequate levels of discussions, the Co-Chairs summarize what has been observed as the highlights of the discussions (second attempt). At this stage, the Co-Chairs then gauge whether there is consensus or not, within the room. Below are possible scenarios that could play out:

3.1.1 No Consensus call:

Based on the discussions and the date the first draft of the proposal was sent to the rpd list, the Co-Chairs may determine that there is no adequate information or clarity on the proposal to make a consensus call, hence the policy will be returned to the mailing list for further discussions.

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3.1.2 No Consensus to Last Call:

Based on the discussions, the co-chair(s) may determine that there is adequate information/clarity on the proposal, to make a consensus call. The consensus call is done by posing next step question(s) to the community and calling for a show of hands. The show of hands is not a vote, but rather an attempt to check the level of agreement of the community with the observations of the Co-Chairs. The proposal is then sent back to the mailing list for further discussions.

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

3.1.3 Consensus to Last call:

Based on the discussions, the co-chair(s) determines there is adequate information/clarity on the proposal to make a consensus call. The consensus call is done by posing next step question(s) to the community and calling for a show of hands. The show of hands is not a vote, but rather an attempt to check the level of agreement of the community with the observations of the Co-Chairs. The proposal is moved to the next level in the PDP (The last call)

3.2 Next Step Questions:

Next step questions could vary based on the level of discussions on the policy proposal. Below are some of the questions that may get posed by the Co-Chairs to the floor:

3.2.1 Should the proposal go to last call "as written"?



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

- 3.2.2 3.2.2 Should the proposal go to last call if the suggested modifications are implemented by the author(s)
- 3.2.3 3.2.3 Is there any significant reason why this proposal should not go to last call at this time?
- 3.2.4 3.2.4 Should the proposal be returned to the mailing list for further discussions?

3.3 Rough Consensus: A proposal is considered to have achieved "Rough Consensus" when all issues are addressed, but not necessarily accommodated in the proposal. Rough consensus is only determined when/if a proposal for last call is observed. i.e In a situation where last call is quite prominent, the Chairs may determine that there is either consensus to move to last call or "Rough Consensus" to move to last call.

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

4.0 Last Call: The Co-Chairs announce the commencement of the last call period on the rpd list and open the floor for any further discussion while indicating a deadline. The last call period provides an opportunity to discuss the proposal again (including providing an updated version if applicable) and give the opportunity for the community to have one last look on its completeness and provide their views. It also gives opportunity for those who were unable to participate during the public policy meeting to contribute. At the end of the last call period, the Co-Chairs determine whether there is consensus to move the proposal to the next level in the PDP. The Co-Chairs consider variety of factors before



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

making this decision, and one of these factors is to determine whether there are new points raised during the last call that significantly impact the proposal. In that case the co-chair(s) may declare no consensus to move the proposal to next step in PDP where the proposal remains open to discussions on the mailing list for presenting again at the next Open Policy face to face meeting.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Consensus building within the AFRINIC PDP

Authors: Seun Ojedeji, Barry Macharia, and Ernest Byaruhanga

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building
Open Microphone

5.0 Objections: While the Co-Chairs try as much as possible to ensure that their decisions reflect the views of the community, there are instances where community member(s) may not agree with the decisions/processes taken by the Co-Chairs. When this arises, such a person has the option of going through the dispute resolution process as stated in the PDP.



28 NOVEMBER - 4 DECEMBER
2015

Policy Development Open Microphone

Policy Development

Agenda

Wed 11:00 – 12:30

Policy Development Process
Policy Implementation
Proposal summary (AFRINIC)
Proposal summary (Other regions)

Wed 13:30 – 15:00

AFPUB-2014-GEN-002
Out of Region Use
AFPUB-2015-GEN-001
Resource Transfer

Wed 15:30 – 17:00

Implementation Experience
Consensus Building

Open Microphone

This is your chance to discuss anything relating to AFRINIC number resource policies, including the policy development process.

- ▶ What works?
- ▶ What doesn't work?
- ▶ What should be changed?
- ▶ What new policies are needed?

- ▶ Please queue up at the microphones
- ▶ When it's your turn, state your name, and have your say